

Document Name	Coll & Tiree Linkspans- Stakeholder Q&A document
Author	Brian Sydney
Date	20 <sup>th</sup> December 2018
Reference	HP/900/9005

**Questions and comments raised at community engagement meetings on 3<sup>rd</sup> December 2018 (Coll) and 4<sup>th</sup> December 2018 (Tiree)**

**Note:** CMAL means Caledonian Maritime Assets Limited, CFL means CalMac Ferries Limited.

Item	Question	Response by	Response
1	Will CMAL/CFL pay for islanders' expenses if they need to travel to the mainland and can't take their car, i.e. – hire cars, bus, rail, etc?	CFL	CFL are working with all service users to understand the requirements throughout the closure.  A service continuity plan will then be developed and presented to Transport Scotland for consideration in terms of affordability.
2	Have CFL allowed for specialist kit to be transported or left on the island during the outage, such as SSE kit?	CFL	CFL will work with all utilities and service providers to understand bespoke requirements.
3	Are CMAL aware that the start of the outage is the winter equinox and that can often lead to stormy weather?	CMAL	We have checked, and the autumn equinox will take place on 23 <sup>rd</sup> September 2018.
4	What are the chances of the work overrunning?	CMAL	The programme for the shutdown has been based on how long the works should take in good weather and a significant weather allowance has been added to this, based on historical weather records. There is however still a risk that the weather is far worse than normal and the works overrun, but the risk is considered low.
5	Is Coll the "guinea pig" project, i.e. is this the first time CMAL have done this type of linkspan replacement?	CMAL	It will be the first time that CMAL have carried out a linkspan replacement on an island with no alternative ferry port. However, the project team of CMAL, George Leslie and Mott MacDonald have a lot of experience of this type of work at other locations. Examples being Wemyss Bay and Brodick, with Oban No.1 in Feb 2019.
6	Will there be additional car parking at Coll, Tiree and Oban so people can leave their cars at the port to use the passenger only service?	CFL	CFL are considering this option to minimise impact on communities throughout the closure periods.

Item	Question	Response by	Response
7	Further to Q6, will CMAL/CFL pay for taxis for people to get to/from the ferry (at either side), so they don't need to park at either terminal?	CFL	CFL are working with all service users to understand the requirements throughout the closure.  A service continuity plan will then be developed and presented to Transport Scotland for consideration in terms of affordability.
8	Will there be liaison/communications with local businesses regarding the alternative ferry services?	CFL	Yes. CFL will be in touch with as many businesses as they can and they will publish further details of service proposals in due course. Businesses with particular concerns are asked to contact CFL or CMAL directly to discuss particular issues.
9	Will the Clansman (passenger only) timetable be adjusted to give flexibility on weather?	CFL	It is expected that MV Clansman will operate the existing winter timetable throughout the closure.  However, amended services may be operated in adverse weather.
10	Will CFL advertise widely that no cars will be able to cross?	CFL	Yes, this will be communicated.
11	Have CMAL/CFL contacted service providers such as Scottish Water, SSE, NHS, Vets, Police, A&BC, Fuel suppliers (Brogans), etc?	CFL	CFL will work with all utilities and service providers to understand bespoke requirements.
12	Can CMAL and CFL please ensure that when they put out any press releases about the works that they re-iterate that despite the restricted service the island is "open for business as usual"?	CMAL/CFL	Yes, we will include comments to this effect in future communications.
13	How will CFL manage people with accessibility issues when the passenger only service is running using only a gangway?	CFL	CFL are adapting gangways to ensure these are accessible.
14	Why do CMAL own so much of the sea loch at Coll (Loch Eatharna)?	CMAL	The harbour area is a historical asset that pre-dates CMAL.

Item	Question	Response by	Response
15	Are CMAL putting in a covered walkway along the pier approach at Tiree? If not, then could it be considered.	CMAL	This has not been directly requested of CMAL previously and will not be included in these works. CMAL may look at this in conjunction with CFL.
16	Can the waiting room at Tiree be brought back into use?	CMAL/CFL	The existing waiting room will be removed as part of the works. CFL are reviewing potential locations for a new waiting room, although this may not be part of these works.
17	Have CFL/CMAL spoken to the police in Oban, to make them aware of the works at both Tiree and Coll?	CFL	CFL/CMAL will inform all utilities and service providers ensure they are aware of the planned closures.
18	How will elderly and infirm passengers be accommodated if they need to get off/on the islands? Some need their cars to carry equipment and also need to use wheelchairs so passenger only service does not suit these situations.	CFL	CFL are adapting gangways to ensure that passenger service is accessible to all passengers.  Additional port staff and crew will be available to assist passengers with movement of 'smaller' goods and cargo on and off gangway.
19	Mail on Coll comes on the ferry as Hebridean Airways is not licensed to carry mail. Handling the mail off the ferry has proved problematic in the past. How will the mail be handled to ensure that the service continues without problems?	CFL	Additional port staff and crew will be available to assist passengers with movement of 'smaller' goods and cargo on and off gangway.
20	Who will cover damages during the lifting on/off of freight?	CFL	This will be discussed with the freight operator when appointed. However, the working assumption is that liability will remain with the freight provider.
21	A number of things need to be considered such as: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Council services</li> <li>• Ambulance access</li> <li>• Locum doctors/ nurses</li> <li>• Emergency repairs (e.g. SSE, Openreach)</li> <li>• Dangerous goods</li> </ul>	CFL	CFL will work with all utilities, service providers and communities to understand their requirements when the linkspan is unavailable.  The resilience of a passenger only service is being considered and CFL are considering mitigation plans.

Item	Question	Response by	Response
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Fuel deliveries</li> <li>Gangway access problems in bad weather, tidal conditions and swell</li> </ul>		
22	It is unfortunate that Coll, Tiree and Colonsay have no alternative routes whereas all other locations have other ports or links.	CMAL	We are aware of this difficulty, hence the early engagement with local communities to try to minimise the degree of disruption to normal life on the islands. All points raised will be considered and ongoing dialogue will take place with stakeholders in order to provide as much service resilience as is reasonably practicable.
23	How about Royal Engineers doing a beach head between Coll and Tiree which can be used for both refurbishments and emergencies. It would be a good exercise for them and practice for war conditions.	CMAL	We have considered the feasibility of a number of options to provide an alternative service to/from Coll and Tiree and between Coll and Tiree. One of these options was the construction of slipways to provide the infrastructure necessary to operate different types of vessels. Unfortunately, this work is not practicable due to the very high associated cost. Employing the Royal Engineers to establish alternative links at Coll and Tiree will be similarly very expensive and unaffordable as the costs would still have to be borne by the Scottish Government.
24	<p>Very concerned about the problems that will arise when you can't take a car off the islands:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Having to visit distant family members on the mainland, often at short notice</li> <li>Transport to/from Glasgow for hospital appointments and operations</li> <li>Transport of heavy loads or amounts to/from the islands which need a car</li> <li>Access to the vessel for some people who will struggle to use the gangway, particularly with luggage</li> <li>Availability of electrical and plumbing spares for winter repairs</li> <li>Transport of sick animals off the island</li> <li>Additional cost involved in hiring cars and getting suitable vehicles for our needs in Oban</li> </ul>	CFL	<p>CFL are considering this option to minimise impact on communities throughout the closure periods and with all service users to understand the requirements throughout the closure.</p> <p>Additional port staff and crew will be available to assist passengers with movement of 'smaller' goods and cargo on and off gangway.</p> <p>A service continuity plan will then be developed and presented to Transport Scotland for consideration in terms of affordability.</p>

Item	Question	Response by	Response
25	Will there be free parking in Oban to leave your car during this period?	CFL	CFL are considering the options available to accommodate a 'park and ride' service at Oban while the linkspan closure are underway.
26	We run self-catering accommodation. October is much quieter, but we wouldn't want customers to be put off because they can't bring their car.	CFL	The dates selected for the closure period have been considered by reviewing the periods of lowest route capacity utilisation to minimise the impact of the closure as much as possible.
27	Contractors often come over at this time of the year to do annual servicing and bring a vehicle. What can be done about this?	CFL	The dates selected for the closure period have been considered by reviewing the periods of lowest route capacity utilisation to minimise the impact of the closure as much as possible. We appreciate that this will still present challenges to some service users and will work with communities to understand their requirements when the linkspan is unavailable.
28	We run a community building. What happens if something goes wrong with important equipment, e.g. fire alarm, electricity/ power outage, mobile mast goes down?	CFL	CFL will work with all utilities, service providers and communities to understand their requirements when the linkspan is unavailable.
29	Seems reasonable to me. However, had to search for the 'bottom line', i.e. no vehicle service around March 2020. Presentation material could be more clear on this.	CMAL/CFL	Point noted. We will make this clearer in future presentation material.
30	Secure parking in Oban a good idea.	CFL	CFL will work with all utilities, service providers and communities to understand their requirements when the linkspan is unavailable.
31	There should be something to encourage holiday makers to still come, e.g. incentives, transport.	CMAL/CFL	Following consultation with the communities, a service continuity plan will then be developed and presented to Transport Scotland for consideration in terms of affordability.
32	With several members of my family, including grandchildren, being on the mainland, I would like to be certain that there was a vehicle available on the mainland for use in an emergency.	CFL	CFL are working with all service users to understand the requirements throughout the closure.

Item	Question	Response by	Response
			A service continuity plan will then be developed and presented to Transport Scotland for consideration in terms of affordability.
33	If there is a cattle/sheep sale during this period, how will this be dealt with?	CFL	CFL understand that no regular sales are scheduled during the duration of the works.
34	How do essential services in an emergency reach Coll, e.g. vet, nurses, etc?	CFL	CFL will work with all utilities, service providers and communities to understand their requirements when the linkspan is unavailable.
35	<p>I am very pleased that this work is being done to our vital connections. Inevitably there will be inconvenience but with the amount of time to plan, it should be possible to keep this to a minimum.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• While we cannot take cars to and from the mainland, some parking arrangements in Oban and Glasgow Airport would be beneficial for people who have arrangements which require them to leave a car there.</li> <li>• Additional storage will be required for foodstuffs, etc at the islands' shops.</li> <li>• Will there be sufficient freight for the large volume of online business?</li> </ul>	CFL	<p>CFL are considering the options available to accommodate a 'park and ride' service at Oban while the linkspan closure are underway.</p> <p>CFL will work with all service users to understand their freight requirements when the linkspan is unavailable.</p>
36	CFL to define freight more widely. This has to include transport for Tiree's community turbine spares and emergency maintenance. Downtime for the turbine can cost the community £3,000 per day in Feb/ March. Not being able to get spares over during the outage could lose the community £45,000+.	CFL	CFL will work with all service users to understand their freight requirements when the linkspan is unavailable.
37	I am the island's police officer and also cover Coll. I regularly travel to Coll for police matters and rely on taking my police vehicle for transport. Liaison should be made with Police Scotland so a contingency plan can be put in place to allow continuity of service during both Coll and Tiree works.	CFL	CFL will contact all utilities, service providers and communities to inform them of the works and understand any requirements when the linkspan is unavailable.

Item	Question	Response by	Response
38	Animal transport required both ways mid-February (10 <sup>th</sup> to 20 <sup>th</sup> ). If outage is March only, this should be workable.	CFL	CFL understand that no regular sales are scheduled during the duration of the works.  We will work with communities to understand any requirements for interisland animal movements.
39	Can the pallet carrier carry cars?	CFL	This will be discussed with the freight operator when appointed. However, the working assumption is that pallet carriers cannot accommodate the transfer of cars.
40	Is carrying fuel as freight an issue?	CFL	Liquid fuels such as diesel/gas oil, petrol, aviation fuel will be transported in bunded tanks.  Other Dangerous Goods such as hay, gases & explosives will be carried in accordance with the certificated requirements of the freight vessel to ensure regulatory compliance.
41	Can you adopt utilisation of mobile cranes to Lo-Lo vehicles on/off the Clansman?	CFL	This option has been discounted as mobile cranes would be required and would result in very high loads placed onto the pier and little clearance and working space for CMAL contractors. Additionally, CFL crew/staff are not trained in cargo lifting operations; banksman training would be required as this is outwith current duties.  Significant safety concerns, heightened in swell conditions/poor weather. Mobile crane axle loads would exceed operational limits of linkspans at Oban, Coll & Tiree and MV Clansman; crane would require to be dismantled, shipped separately in parts then re-assembled on site.

Item	Question	Response by	Response
42	Funeral arrangements	CFL	In the unfortunate event of a death on the island, CFL are considering alternative methods to repatriate remains.
43	Freight service <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Palletisation of goods – where and how</li> <li>• Frequency</li> <li>• Onward transport of freight</li> </ul>	CFL	CFL are in the process of defining the freight service and will engage with communities to understand their needs. Once this is understood, the frequency and process for managing this will be considered.
44	How will the banks be affected?	CFL	CFL will contact all utilities, service providers and communities to inform them of the works and understand any requirements when the linkspan is unavailable.
45	How will refuse off the island be managed?	CFL	CFL will contact all utilities, service providers and communities to inform them of the works and understand any requirements when the linkspan is unavailable.
46	Could MV Lord of the Isles not provide a passenger service, as she has a lower passenger deck this would reduce the gradient of the gangway?	CFL	<p>This option will be considered. However, this does present some challenges.</p> <p>This would require Coll closure phase brought forward from 28/10 to 21/10, presenting possible capacity issues on the route.</p> <p>Would requires major vessel overhaul schedule to be revised; risk of revised Coll closure phase overrunning into LOTI overhaul period.</p>

Questions and Comments raised via website

Item	Question	Date Raised	Response by	Response
1	I unfortunately was off island for an NHS appointment and would welcome knowing where I can get more info about what CMAL and Calmac said and what questions were asked and answered	9/12/18	CMAL	We are in the process of collating the questions and comments raised during our visits last week. We will be posting these, along with initial responses to as many questions as we can, in the coming days.
2	The work will be planned for a set period but as weather can impact the finish date, does CMAL have contingency plans for over running? Particularly if vehicles need to get off the island? We have long-term workers who could come to Coll before the linkspan begins and would plan to leave after the work is completed and could not be in a situation where they have to leave a vehicle behind if the work on the link span over runs.	17/12/18	CMAL/CFL	<p>Thank you for submitting the question on our website in relation to proposed linkspan works. Firstly, regarding the impact of weather, we are confident that the work will be completed within the window stated. We have assumed that the outage period at Coll will be 24 days which is about 3.5 weeks based on a 7-day working week (which the contractor is likely to seek to implement while he is on the island to minimise the construction period). Of this period, we have calculated that there is 14 day's work content and have allowed 10 days of contingency to account for bad weather. This contingency has been calculated from weather records (from Tiree MET Office weather station) going back to 1970. Based on the records reviewed, we have based the 10 day contingency on 1 in 10 year weather events ((ie the worst weather over an average 10 year period will be experienced). There should therefore be a 90% chance that the weather will not be as bad as we have allowed for, meaning that some of the 10 day contingency should not be required and therefore leading to completion of the work before the overall 24 day period.</p> <p>There is of course the chance that we experience exceptionally poor weather in excess of what we could on average expect once in every 10 years. I have therefore asked the ferry operator, Calmac, to comment on what contingency measures could be put in place if this is the case. We will come back to you with a response soon.</p>

